

2024



---

# AP<sup>®</sup> English Literature and Composition

## Sample Student Responses and Scoring Commentary Set 1

DRAFT

These exam materials may **not** be posted on school or personal websites, nor electronically redistributed for any reason without the express permission of College Board.

These training materials may be used solely for noncommercial purposes by AP teachers and students for course exam preparation. Permission for any other use must be sought from College Board. Teachers may reproduce these training materials in whole or in part, in limited quantities, for noncommercial, face-to-face teaching purposes, as long as the copyright notices are kept intact.

© 2024 College Board. College Board, Advanced Placement, AP, AP Central, and the acorn logo are registered trademarks of College Board. Visit College Board on the web: [collegeboard.org](https://collegeboard.org).

AP Central is the official online home for the AP Program: [apcentral.collegeboard.org](https://apcentral.collegeboard.org).

## ENGLISH LITERATURE AND COMPOSITION

## SECTION II

Total time—2 hours

3 Questions

## Question 1

(Suggested time—40 minutes. This question counts as one-third of the total essay section score.)

In John Rollin Ridge’s poem “To a Star Seen at Twilight,” published in 1868, the speaker admires a solitary star shining at twilight and considers its significance. Read the poem carefully. Then, in a well-written essay, analyze how Ridge uses literary elements and techniques to convey the speaker’s complex reflection on the star.

In your response you should do the following:

- Respond to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation.
- Select and use evidence to support your line of reasoning.
- Explain how the evidence supports your line of reasoning.
- Use appropriate grammar and punctuation in communicating your argument.

## To a Star Seen at Twilight

<p>Hail solitary star! That shinest from thy far blue height, And overlookest Earth <i>Line</i> And Heaven, companionless in light! 5 The rays around thy brow Are an eternal wreath for thee; Yet thou’rt not proud, like man, Though thy broad mirror is the sea, And thy calm home eternity!</p> <p>10 Shine on, night-bosomed star! And through its realms thy soul’s eye dart, And count each age of light, For their eternal wheel thou art.</p> <p>Thou dost roll into the past days, 15 Years, and ages too, And naught thy giant progress stays.</p>	<p>I love to gaze upon Thy speaking face, thy calm, fair brow, And feel my spirit dark 20 And deep, grow bright and pure as thou. Like thee it stands alone; Like thee its native home is night, But there the likeness ends,— It beams not with thy steady light. 25 Its upward path is high, But not so high as thine—thou’rt far Above the reach of clouds, Of storms, of wreck, oh lofty star! I would all men might look 30 Upon thy pure sublimity, And in their bosoms drink Thy loveliness and light like me; For who in all the world Could gaze upon thee thus, and feel 35 Aught in his nature base, Or mean, or low, around him steal!</p>
---	--

Shine on companionless  
As now thou seem'st. Thou art the throne  
Of thy own spirit, star!  
40 And mighty things must be alone.  
Alone the ocean heaves,  
Or calms his bosom into sleep;  
Alone each mountain stands  
Upon its basis broad and deep;  
45 Alone through heaven the comets sweep,  
Those burning worlds which God has thrown  
Upon the universe in wrath,  
As if he hated them—their path  
No stars, no suns may follow, *none*—  
50 'Tis great, 'tis great to be alone!

---

**Begin your response to this question at the top of a new page in the separate Free Response booklet and fill in the appropriate circle at the top of each page to indicate the question number.**

**Question 1: Poetry Analysis****6 points**

In John Rollin Ridge’s poem “To a Star Seen at Twilight,” published in 1868, the speaker admires a solitary star shining at twilight and considers its significance. Read the poem carefully. Then, in a well-written essay, analyze how Ridge uses literary elements and techniques to convey the speaker’s complex reflection on the star.

In your response you should do the following:

- Respond to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation.
- Select and use evidence to support your line of reasoning.
- Explain how the evidence supports your line of reasoning.
- Use appropriate grammar and punctuation in communicating your argument.

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria	
<b>Row A</b> <b>Thesis</b> <b>(0-1 points)</b>	<b>0 points</b> For any of the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There is no defensible thesis.</li> <li>• The intended thesis only restates the prompt.</li> <li>• The intended thesis provides a summary of the issue with no apparent or coherent claim.</li> <li>• There is a thesis, but it does not respond to the prompt.</li> </ul>	<b>1 point</b> Responds to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation of the poem.
<b>Decision Rules and Scoring Notes</b>		
<b>Responses that do not earn this point:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Only restate the prompt.</li> <li>• Make a generalized comment about the poem that doesn't respond to the prompt.</li> <li>• Describe the poem or features of the poem rather than making a claim that requires a defense.</li> </ul>		<b>Responses that earn this point:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provide a defensible interpretation of the speaker's complex reflection on the star.</li> </ul>
<b>Examples that do not earn this point:</b> <b>Restate the prompt</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>"The speaker admires a star at twilight and has a complex reflection on it."</i></li> <li>• <i>"John Rollin Ridge employs multiple literary elements and techniques to convey the speaker's reflection in all its complexity."</i></li> </ul> <b>Do not relate to the prompt</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>"Looking at the sky can inspire a lot of thought and emotion."</i></li> </ul> <b>Describe the poem or features of the poem</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>"What makes this poem particularly striking is that the speaker talks to a star."</i></li> </ul>		<b>Examples that earn this point:</b> <b>Provide a defensible interpretation</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>"The speaker of the poem compares humankind to the star seen at twilight, which emphasizes the speaker's sense of wonder of the star and dissatisfaction with being human."</i></li> <li>• <i>"Clearly the speaker of the poem wishes to be as alone as the star he sees in the sky, as he equates being 'companionless' with being sublime."</i></li> <li>• <i>"Through rhyme, imagery, and direct address, Ridge presents the speaker of the poem as someone who projects his desire to escape human nature onto the star, which he admires and yet can never truly emulate."</i></li> </ul>
<b>Additional Notes:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The thesis may be more than one sentence, provided the sentences are in close proximity.</li> <li>• The thesis may be anywhere within the response.</li> <li>• For a thesis to be defensible, the poem must include at least minimal evidence that <i>could</i> be used to support that thesis; however, the student need not cite that evidence to earn the thesis point.</li> <li>• The thesis <i>may</i> establish a line of reasoning that structures the essay, but it needn't do so to earn the thesis point.</li> <li>• A thesis that meets the criteria can be awarded the point whether or not the rest of the response successfully supports that line of reasoning.</li> </ul>		

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria				
<p><b>Row B Evidence AND Commentary (0-4 points)</b></p>	<p><b>0 points</b> Simply restates thesis (if present), repeats provided information, or offers information irrelevant to the prompt.</p>	<p><b>1 point</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides evidence that is mostly general.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Summarizes the evidence but does not explain how the evidence supports the student’s argument.</p>	<p><b>2 points</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides some specific, relevant evidence.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Explains how some of the evidence relates to the student’s argument, but no line of reasoning is established, or the line of reasoning is faulty.</p>	<p><b>3 points</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides specific evidence to support all claims in a line of reasoning.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Explains how some of the evidence supports a line of reasoning.  <b>AND</b> Explains how at least one literary element or technique in the poem contributes to its meaning.</p>	<p><b>4 points</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides specific evidence to support all claims in a line of reasoning.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Consistently explains how the evidence supports a line of reasoning.  <b>AND</b> Explains how multiple literary elements or techniques in the poem contribute to its meaning.</p>
<b>Decision Rules and Scoring Notes</b>					
<p><b>Typical responses that earn 0 points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Are incoherent or do not address the prompt.</li> <li>• May be just opinion with no textual references or references that are irrelevant.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Typical responses that earn 1 point:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Tend to focus on summary or description of a poem rather than specific details or techniques.</li> <li>• Mention literary elements, devices, or techniques with little or no explanation.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Typical responses that earn 2 points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Consist of a mix of specific evidence and broad generalities.</li> <li>• May contain some simplistic, inaccurate, or repetitive explanations that don’t strengthen the argument.</li> <li>• May make one point well but either do not make multiple supporting claims or do not adequately support more than one claim.</li> <li>• Do not explain the connections or progression between the student’s claims, so a line of reasoning is not clearly established.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Typical responses that earn 3 points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Uniformly offer evidence to support claims.</li> <li>• Focus on the importance of specific words and details from the poem to build an interpretation.</li> <li>• Organize an argument as a line of reasoning composed of multiple supporting claims.</li> <li>• Commentary may fail to integrate some evidence or fail to support a key claim.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Typical responses that earn 4 points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Uniformly offer evidence to support claims.</li> <li>• Focus on the importance of specific words and details from the poem to build an interpretation.</li> <li>• Organize and support an argument as a line of reasoning composed of multiple supporting claims, each with adequate evidence that is clearly explained.</li> <li>• Explain how the writer’s use of multiple literary techniques contributes to the student’s interpretation of the poem.</li> </ul>	
<p><b>Additional Notes:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Writing that suffers from grammatical and/or mechanical errors that interfere with communication cannot earn the fourth point in this row.</li> <li>• To earn the fourth point in this row, the response may observe multiple instances of the same literary element or technique if each instance further contributes to the meaning of the poem.</li> </ul>					

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria	
<b>Row C</b> <b>Sophistication</b> <b>(0-1 points)</b>	<b>0 points</b> Does not meet the criteria for one point.	<b>1 point</b> Demonstrates sophistication of thought and/or develops a complex literary argument.
	<b>Decision Rules and Scoring Notes</b>	
	<b>Responses that do not earn this point:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Attempt to contextualize their interpretation, but such attempts consist predominantly of sweeping generalizations (“<i>Human experiences always include...</i>” OR “<i>In a world where...</i>” OR “<i>Since the beginning of time...</i>”).</li> <li>• Only hint at or suggest other possible interpretations (“<i>While another reader may see...</i>” OR “<i>Though the poem could be said to...</i>”).</li> <li>• Make a single statement about how an interpretation of the poem comments on something thematic without consistently maintaining that thematic interpretation.</li> <li>• Oversimplify complexities in the poem.</li> <li>• Use complicated or complex sentences or language that is ineffective because it does not enhance the student’s argument.</li> </ul>	<b>Responses that earn this point may demonstrate a sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument by doing any of the following:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Identifying and exploring complexities or tensions within the poem.</li> <li>2. Illuminating the student’s interpretation by situating it within a broader context.</li> <li>3. Accounting for alternative interpretations of the poem.</li> <li>4. Employing a style that is consistently vivid and persuasive.</li> </ol>
<b>Additional Notes:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This point should be awarded only if the sophistication of thought or complex understanding is part of the student’s argument, not merely a phrase or reference.</li> </ul>		





● Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

It transcends beyond "the reach of clouds" and continues to shine brighter.  
 Ultimately, Ridge worships the star's perseverance and capacity to "shine on companionless." His ~~glorifying~~ glorifying<sup>of</sup> the solitary star ignites his epiphany that "mighty things must be alone," and his knack for solitude ~~can~~ can foster empowerment. Ridge continues by listing ~~various~~ various elements of nature that rule in solitude: "Alone the ocean heaves," and "Alone each mountain stands." Through his complex reflection on the star above him, Ridge ~~harnesses~~ harnesses a newfound sense of power.

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0077201



Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3

Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

In John Rollin Ridge's poem "To a Star Seen at Twilight", Ridge utilizes heavy repetition with phrases exclaiming the nature of solitude which is paired with a unique outlook on the beauty of a star's outcasted position in the night. In order to show appreciation of such holy creations, ultimately preaching how solitude is ~~not~~ not always an act of banishment or lack of belonging in the world.

~~Immediately~~ Immediately, Ridge sets the tone of appreciation for his topic by exclaiming, "Hail solitary star!" (line 1) which <sup>practically</sup> sets the stage for a shameless narration on solitude. ~~The heavy repetition of words such as "alone" and "solitude" serve to normalize an outcasted position.~~ He then continues to admire such a powerful creation by noting that it shines from even great heights and it's a creation by Heaven (lines 2-4). However, although the narrator's appreciation is proud, the speaker notes the being is "not proud, like man" (line 7) in order to clarify the purity of the star. With such a pure ~~but~~ creation yet so far from Earth, one cannot fathom it was outcasted there as ~~an~~ a malicious act. In this way, the nature of the star's solitude is not viewed as a sad position but rather a position ~~of beauty~~ honor or love because of its purity. The narrator continues to explain how even men, when before the speaker noted humanity is too proud, "look upon thy pure sublimity" and feel appreciation for nature and its love (lines 30-36). Near the end of

Page 2

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

- **Important:** Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

the narrator's poem of appreciation, he exclaims "mighty things must be alone" (line 40) - clearly broadcasting a statement supported by his earlier ~~the~~ lines and ultimately preaching the honor in natural solitude.

With the repetition of words such as "alone" and "solitude", Ridge further normalizes natural solitude. Especially in lines 40-50, the speaker ~~the~~ continues with the repeated diction of solitude ~~the~~ to provide natural examples of honorable and accepted ~~the~~ creations of solitude.

He explains "alone the ocean heaves" which the ocean before was ~~explained~~ noted to be a mirror of his treasured star (line 8) and the sea is calm and mighty. Mountains and comets, each example at different levels on Earth and sky to show ~~the~~ how beautiful solitude is everywhere, are also used to show the honor in solitude. ~~the~~ As reflected in the rest of the poem, "tis great to be alone!" (line 50) and such state of solitude is honorable as the greatest creations have embraced it.

Page 3

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0324452



Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

A common goal for most seems to be finding companionship, whether this be romantically or platonically, as humans it is natural for us to depend on others for validation and comfort. However, it is equally important to gain self-validation and respect. Growing a dependency on others may lead us to lose our sense of self if ~~it is taken~~ <sup>it is taken</sup> too far. By <sup>use of</sup> personification, repetition, and <sup>powerful diction</sup> ~~symbolism~~, Ridge crafts a <sup>splendid</sup> ~~testimony~~ testimony to the importance of self-fulfillment, in his poem "To a Star Seen at Twilight".

This entire poem is built around the star being personified as the main subject. For example, "Thy speaking Face, thy calm, fair brow,". By describing the star as 'calm' and 'fair' Ridge is able to send the message that the star is wise and content with being on its own. In another instance he says, "Upon thy pure sublimity", once again emphasizing the current state of the star being at peace. The use of the word 'pure' here also shows that the star is untainted by heartbreak and is <sup>not</sup> ~~is~~ in need of anyone else.

Throughout this text <sup>there</sup> ~~are~~ are many points of repetition that help emphasize the overall theme of independence. The main type of repetition in this poem is anaphora. In the first stanza lines three and four each start with "And", and refer to the stars ability to overlook the universe emphasizing its <sup>timeless</sup> ~~timeless~~ wisdom. In stanza <sup>four</sup> ~~the~~ (lines twenty-one and twenty-two), both lines begin with "Like thee...". This reaffirms to ~~the~~ the audience that the narrator wishes to be like the star but has certain limitations.

Page 2

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

● Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

He cannot be as steady or constant as the star, but he can try to find peace in solitude.

The ~~author's~~ writer's choice of wording is very intentional within this poem. ~~He uses words such as~~ He says in line ~~3~~<sup>Six</sup> "Are an eternal wrath for thee", and in line four, "And Heaven, companions in ~~stars~~<sup>light!</sup>". The use of words such as 'eternal', and 'heaven' offer an almost divine quality to the stars. This along with the usage of words such as 'mighty' ~~and~~<sup>in line forty</sup> shows us that one can be powerful on their own, just a star shines or the ocean heaves without any help.

As the audience reads this poem, it is clear that Ridge is able to convey his message of finding power through independence by his honed use of personification, repetition, and ~~total~~<sup>impactful</sup> diction.

Page 3

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0309679



Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3

Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

In the poem "A Star Seen at Twilight" by John Rollin Ridge, the author utilizes personification, analogies, and natural diction to convey the captivated yet regretful attitude towards the star, illustrating that although sedentary, nature is very powerful and beautiful.

First, Ridge uses personification ~~to talk to the star itself~~ <sup>by having the speaker</sup> talk to the star directly as if it were a person, worshipping it and glorifying it. "I love to gaze upon thy speaking face, thy calm, fair brow, and feel my spirit dark and deep, grow bright and pure as thou." (17-20) The speaker directly speaking to the star, telling it how much he loves to stare at its face, is a perfect example of personification in this poem. Not only the conversation, but the "face" of the star are used to describe how beautiful the star is.

Secondly, the author utilizes analogies to ~~compare~~ <sup>show that</sup> nothing in the universe compares to the star's beauty. "As now thou seem'st, thou art the throne of thy own spirit, star! And mighty things must be done" (38-40) Here the speaker explains that the star is alone in terms of beauty and role.

Finally, the author uses natural diction to convey the captivated yet regretful attitude towards the star. Although the speaker is captivated by the star's beauty, he feels ashamed and regretful that he's the only person who feels this way. "Oh lofty star! I would all men might look upon thy pure sublimity, And in their bosoms shrink thy loveliness and light like me" (28-32) This means that he is the only one captivated by the star's

Page 2

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

● Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

beauty, and he's ashamed of that.

So, in the poem "To a Star Seen at Twilight," John Rollin Ridge uses personification, analogies, and natural fiction to convey the captivated yet respectful reflection of the speaker on the stars, illustrating that although sedentary, nature is very powerful and beautiful.

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0293931



Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

In the poem the speaker has an exciting, and passionate relationship to the star. The speaker talks about the star in a calming tone as if it's a new paradise for him while watching the star. During the poem the speaker reflects on the star as a eternal wheel thou art. This gives us an imagination that what the speaker sees while looking at the star is pure and calming for him. And that he feels a certain calmness and sympathy towards the star almost as if it was something well loved by the speaker.

Page 2

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.





## Question 1 – Poetry Analysis

### Sample Identifier: A

Score: 1-4-1

#### A. Thesis Score: 1

- This astute essay thoroughly examines the complex insight the speaker gains from a solitary star in John Rollin Ridge’s poem, “To a Star Seen at Twilight.”
- The thesis of the essay, “In John Rollin Ridge’s poem, ‘To a Star Seen at Twilight,’ he examines the solitary star’s eternal reign and explores the glorious empowerment derived from its solitude—ultimately constructing his epiphany on human lonesomeness,” presents a defensible interpretation of the poem and comprises the first paragraph of the essay. It earned 1 point in Row A.

#### B. Evidence Score: 4

- The response establishes its line of reasoning, which focuses on the greatness and power of the star, in the thesis and throughout the essay. The essay provides specific evidence to support its claims by examining the phrases “eternal wreath” and “companionless in light” in paragraph 2. These phrases demonstrate that “Ridge begins recognize the empowerment cultivated by solitude.” In paragraph 3, the essay points out the strength of the star as it “can surpass any obstacle, ‘storm,’ or ‘wreck’ in its path” and “transcends beyond ‘the reach of clouds’ and continues to shine brighter.” Additionally, the essay asserts “Ridge continues by listing various elements of nature that rule in solitude: ‘Alone the ocean heaves,’ and ‘Alone each mountain stands’” (paragraph 3). This evidence is used to support the essay’s focus on the star’s strength.
- The commentary of the essay consistently connects the evidence to the thesis. For example, in paragraph 2, the essay offers the insightful observations that “Grand, companionless, and powerful—each describe the star’s position in the sky” and “Unlike humankind, the solitary star is immune to corruption or arrogance.” In the final paragraph, the essay asserts “His glorifying of the solitary star ignites his epiphany that ‘mighty things must be alone,’ and his knick for solitude can foster empowerment.”
- The essay thoroughly explains how multiple literary elements and techniques contribute to the meaning of the poem. For example, in paragraph 2, the response characterizes the star when stating, “Ridge begins his complex reflexion on the solitary star by characterizing its grandure: as its rays create a bright ‘eternal wreath,’ the star ascends above all to overlook ‘Heaven’ and ‘Earth.’” Additionally, the response illustrates how comparison is used by observing, “Ridge furthers his reflection on the star by comparing his shared qualities of the star and seeking to internalize its greatness” (paragraph 3). This combination of specific evidence, perceptive commentary, and careful examination of literary devices in the poem thoroughly supports the claims and enhances the line of reasoning. The response earned 4 points in Row B.

#### C. Sophistication Score: 1

- This essay demonstrates sophistication of thought through its exploration of the complexity of the relationship between the star and the speaker. In paragraph 3, for

example, the essay notes that the speaker finds “shared lonesomeness with the great star that radiates above him, and finds a gravitating connection to it.” The exploration of these complexities builds to a decisive conclusion: “Through his complex reflection of the star above him, Ridge harnesses a newfound sense of power.” The essay, therefore, earned 1 point in Row C.

**Sample Identifier: B**

**Score: 1-4-0**

**A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This solid response analyzes how Ridge uses literary elements to convey the speaker’s complex reflection on the star and considers the significance of solitude.
- The introductory paragraph presents the thesis statement, “In John Rollin Ridge’s poem ‘To a Star Seen at Twilight,’ Ridge utilizes heavy repetition with phrases exclaiming the nature of solitude which is paired with a unique outlook on the beauty of a star’s outcasted position in the night in order to show appreciation of such holy creations, ultimately preaching how solitude is not always an act of banishment or lack of belonging in the world.” Because the essay responds to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation of the poem, it earned 1 point in Row A.

**B. Evidence Score: 4**

- The response provides specific evidence to support all claims in a line of reasoning that centers around the honorable nature of solitude. In paragraph 2, the essay points out the significance of the first line of the poem, “Hail solitary star!” and argues “the speaker notes the being is ‘not proud, like man’ (line 7) in order to clarify the purity of the star.”
- The essay goes on to consider the connection between the star and humankind when stating in paragraph 2, “The narrator continues to explain how even men, when before the speaker noted humanity is too proud, ‘look upon thy pure sublimity’ and feel appreciation for nature and its love (lines 30-36).”
- The textual evidence provided is paired effectively with commentary that relates each piece to the line of reasoning. In paragraph 2, after pointing out the significance of line 7 in the poem, the essay argues “With such a pure creation yet so far from Earth, one cannot fathom it was outcasted there as a malicious act. In this way the nature of the star’s solitude is not viewed as a sad position but rather a position honor or love because of its purity.” The commentary continues near the end of paragraph 2 with the insightful statement, “Near the end of the narrator’s poem of appreciation, he exclaims ‘mighty things must be done alone’ (line 40), clearly broadcasting a statement supported by his earlier lines and ultimately preaching the honor in natural solitude.”
- The essay contemplates how Ridge’s use of multiple literary elements and techniques contribute to the meaning of the poem. The response considers the importance of tone and repetition: “With the repetition of words such as ‘alone’ and ‘solitude,’ Ridge further normalizes natural solitude. Especially in lines 40-50, the speaker continues with the repeated diction of solitude to provide natural examples of honorable and accepted creations of solitude” (paragraph 3). Because the essay provides specific evidence, consistently explains how that evidence supports a line of reasoning, and explains how

multiple literary elements contribute to the meaning of the poem, it earned 4 points in Row B.

### **C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- Although the essay is clearly written, it does not demonstrate sophistication of thought or present a complex literary argument; thus, it did not earn the point in Row C.

### **Sample Identifier: C**

**Score: 1-3-0**

#### **A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This response contemplates the speaker’s reaction to a star as described in “To a Star Seen at Twilight” by John Rollin Ridge.
- The essay responds to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation of the poem. Located in the final sentence of the introductory paragraph, the thesis states, “By use of personification, repetition, and powerful diction, Ridge crafts a splendid testimony to the importance of self-fulfillment in his poem ‘To a Star Seen at Twilight.’” This thesis earned 1 point in Row A.

#### **B. Evidence Score: 3**

- The essay creates a line of reasoning that focuses on “self-fulfillment” and “independence.” The essay offers specific evidence to support this line of reasoning. For example, in paragraph 2, the essay examines the line, “‘Thy speaking face, thy calm, fair brow’” and argues that, through the use of this line, “Ridge is able to send the message that the star is wise and content with being on its own.” In paragraph 4, the response argues “The use of words such as ‘eternal,’ and ‘heaven,’ offer an almost divine quality to the star.”
- Through its commentary, the response makes a solid attempt to explain how the evidence provided supports the line of reasoning. In paragraph 2, for example, the essay argues “The use of the word ‘pure’ here also shows that the star is untainted by heartbreak and is not in need of anyone else.”
- The response does not, however, always effectively support its claim about independence that is presented in paragraph 3: “Throughout this text there are many points of repetition that help emphasize the overall theme of independence.” The response notes the repetition of the word “And” in lines 3 and 4 and of the phrase “Like thee” in lines 21 and 22, but it does not effectively connect this evidence to its claim. The final sentence of that paragraph states, “This reaffirms to the audience that the narrator wishes to be like the star but has certain limitations. He cannot be as steady or constant as the star, but he can try to find peace in solitude.” The connection between this claim and the poet’s choice to begin lines with repeated words remains unclear.
- Each body paragraph of the essay focuses on a literary device: personification, repetition, and diction. The response strives to explain how each device contributes to the meaning of the poem in sentences such as “Throughout this text there are many points of repetition that help emphasize the overall theme of independence. The main type of repetition in this

poem is anaphora. In the first stanza lines three and four each start with ‘And,’ and refer to the stars ability to overlook the universe emphasizing its timeless wisdom.” This response earned 3 points in Row B due to presentation of specific evidence, its explanation of how some of the evidence supports the line of reasoning, and its explanation of how literary elements contribute to the meaning of the poem.

### **C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- The essay did not, however, earn the sophistication point in Row C as it does not demonstrate sophistication of thought, nor does it develop a complex literary argument.

### **Sample Identifier: D**

**Score: 1-2-0**

#### **A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This essay considers how John Rollin Ridge uses literary elements and techniques to convey the speaker’s thoughts about the star.
- The thesis of the essay appears in paragraph 1 and states, “In the poem ‘To a Star Seen at Twilight’ by John Rollin Ridge, the author utilizes personification, analogies, and natural diction to convey the captivated yet regretful attitude towards the star, illustrating that although sedintary, nature is very powerful and beautiful.” Because the thesis presents a defensible interpretation of the poem, the essay earned 1 point in Row A.

#### **B. Evidence Score: 2**

- The evidence provided in the essay focuses on the beauty of the star. In paragraph 3, for example, the essay points to the line, “‘As now thou seem’st. Thou art the throne of thy own spirit, star! And mighty things must be alone’ (38-40).’ Here, the speaker explains that the star is alone in terms of beauty and role.” Although the essay discusses the beauty of the star, no clear line of reasoning is established.
- The response explains how some of the evidence relates to the interpretation, such as in paragraph 2 where, discussing personification, the response states, “The speaker directly speaking to the star, telling it how much he loves to stare at its face, is a perfect example of personification in the poem. Not only the conversation, but the ‘face’ of the star are used to describe how beautiful the star is.” The commentary is simplistic and does not strengthen the argument.
- While the essay mentions several literary devices, such as personification, analogies, and “natural diction,” little explanation of their function in the poem is offered.

#### **C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- The response does not demonstrate sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument. It did not earn the point in Row C.

**Sample Identifier: E**

**Score: 1-1-0**

**A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This brief essay attempts to analyze how John Rollin Ridge uses literary elements and techniques to convey the speaker’s complex reflection on the star in the poem “To a Star Seen at Twilight.”
- The response offers a defensible interpretation of the poem in the second sentence: “The speaker talks about the star in a calming tone as if its a new paradise for him while watching the star.” The thesis earned 1 point in Row A.

**B. Evidence Score: 1**

- The response provides evidence that is mostly general and tends to focus on description. The third sentence of the essay says, “During the poem the speaker reflects on the star as a eternan wheel thou art,” which inexactly references line 13 of the poem without quotation marks. The scant amount of evidence does not support the essay’s thesis, and no line of reasoning is established.
- The commentary is also brief and does not connect the evidence to the argument: “This gives us an imagination that what the speaker sees while looking at the star is pure and calming for him” (sentence 4).
- The essay refers to “a calming tone,” but no explanation of how the tone is developed or how it contributes to the meaning of the poem is offered.

**C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- The response does not demonstrate sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument.

## Question 2

(Suggested time—40 minutes. This question counts as one-third of the total essay section score.)

The following excerpt is from Mavis Gallant’s short story “One Morning in June,” published in 1952. In this passage, Mike Cahill is in France for one year to explore his talent for art. Read the passage carefully. Then, in a well-written essay, analyze how Gallant uses literary elements and techniques to convey Mike’s complex experience of studying painting.

In your response you should do the following:

- Respond to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation.
- Select and use evidence to support your line of reasoning.
- Explain how the evidence supports your line of reasoning.
- Use appropriate grammar and punctuation in communicating your argument.

Line He had come to France because the words “art”  
and “Paris” were unbreakably joined in his family’s  
imagination, the legend of Trilby’s Bohemia<sup>1</sup>  
5 persisting long after the truth of it had died. When his  
high school art teacher, a young woman whose  
mobiles<sup>2</sup> had been praised, pronounced that his was a  
talent not to be buried under the study of medicine or  
law, his family had decided that a year in Paris would  
show whether or not his natural bent was toward  
10 painting. It was rather like exposing someone to a  
case of measles and watching for spots to break out.

In Paris, Mike had spent the first three weeks  
standing in the wrong queue at the Beaux-Arts,<sup>3</sup> and  
when no one seemed able to direct him to the right  
15 one, he had given up the Beaux-Arts entirely and  
joined a class instructed by an English painter called  
Chitterley, whose poster advertisement he had seen in  
a café. It was Mr. Chitterley’s custom to turn his  
young charges loose on the city and then, once a week  
20 or so, comment on their work in a borrowed studio on  
the Quai d’Anjou.<sup>4</sup> Mike painted with sober patience  
the bridges of the Seine, the rain-soaked lawns of the  
Tuileries, and a head-on view of Notre Dame. His  
paintings were large (Mr. Chitterley was nearsighted),  
25 askew (as he had been taught in the public schools of  
New York), and empty of people (he had never been  
taught to draw, and it was not his nature to take  
chances).

“Very *interesting*,” said Mr. Chitterley of Mike’s  
30 work. Squinting a little, he would add, “Ah! I *see* what  
you were trying to do here!”

“You do?” Mike wished he would be more specific,  
for he sometimes recognized that his pictures were

flat, empty, and the color of cement. At first, he had  
35 blamed the season, for the Paris winter had been  
sunless; later on, he saw that its gray contained every  
shade in a beam of light, but this effect he was unable  
to reproduce. Unnerved by the pressure of time, he  
watched his work all winter, searching for the clue  
40 that would set him on a course. Prodded in the  
direction of art, he now believed in it, enjoying, above  
all, the solitude, the sense of separateness, the  
assembling of parts into something reasonable. He  
might have been equally happy at a quiet table,  
45 gathering into something ticking and ordered the  
scattered wheels of a watch, but this had not been  
suggested, and he had most certainly never given it a  
thought. At last, when the season had rained itself to  
an end (and his family innocently were prepared to  
50 have him exhibit his winter’s harvest in some garret<sup>5</sup>  
of the Left Bank and send home the critics’ clippings),  
he approached Mr. Chitterley and asked what he  
ought to do next.

“Why, go to the country,” said Mr. Chitterley, who  
55 was packing for a holiday with the owner of the Quai  
d’Anjou studio. “Go south. Don’t stop in a hotel but  
live on the land, in a tent, and paint, paint, paint, paint,  
paint!”

“I can’t afford it,” Mike said. “I mean I can’t afford  
60 to buy the tent and stuff. But I can stay over here until  
August, if you think there’s any point. I mean is it  
wasting time for me to paint, paint, paint?”

Mr. Chitterley shot him an offended look and then  
a scornful one, which said, How like an American!  
65 The only measuring rods, time and money. Aloud, he  
suggested Menton.<sup>6</sup> He had stayed there as a child,

and he remembered it as a paradise of lemon ice and sunshine. Mike, for want of a better thought, or even a contrastive one, took the train there a day later.

<sup>1</sup> *Trilby*, a popular 1894 novel by George du Maurier, focuses on the unconventional lifestyles of artists and musicians in 1850s Paris.

<sup>2</sup> suspended decorative sculptures designed to move with air currents

<sup>3</sup> a famous art school in Paris

<sup>4</sup> a neighborhood on the Île Saint-Louis, an island in the Seine river in Paris

<sup>5</sup> a small, dismal attic room

<sup>6</sup> a town on the French Riviera

“One Morning in June” by Mavis Gallant. Copyright © 1952 by Mavis Gallant. First appeared in the June 7, 1952 issue of *The New Yorker*. Reprinted by permission of Georges Borchardt, Inc., on behalf of the author’s estate. All rights reserved.

---

**Begin your response to this question at the top of a new page in the separate Free Response booklet and fill in the appropriate circle at the top of each page to indicate the question number.**

**Question 2: Prose Fiction Analysis****6 points**

The following excerpt is from Mavis Gallant’s short story “One Morning in June,” published in 1952. In this passage, Mike Cahill is in France for one year to explore his talent for art. Read the passage carefully. Then, in a well-written essay, analyze how Gallant uses literary elements and techniques to convey Mike’s complex experience of studying painting.

In your response you should do the following:

- Respond to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation.
- Select and use evidence to support your line of reasoning.
- Explain how the evidence supports your line of reasoning.
- Use appropriate grammar and punctuation in communicating your argument.



Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria	
<b>Row A</b> <b>Thesis</b> <b>(0-1 points)</b>	<b>0 points</b> For any of the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There is no defensible thesis.</li> <li>• The intended thesis only restates the prompt.</li> <li>• The intended thesis provides a summary of the issue with no apparent or coherent claim.</li> <li>• There is a thesis, but it does not respond to the prompt.</li> </ul>	<b>1 point</b> Responds to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation of the passage.
<b>Decision Rules and Scoring Notes</b>		
<b>Responses that do not earn this point:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Only restate the prompt.</li> <li>• Make a generalized comment about the passage that doesn't respond to the prompt.</li> <li>• Describe the passage or features of the passage rather than making a claim that requires a defense.</li> </ul>		<b>Responses that earn this point:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provide a defensible interpretation of Mike's complex experience of studying painting.</li> </ul>
<b>Examples that do not earn this point:</b> <b>Restate the prompt</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>"In this excerpt, the author develops Mike's complex experience while he studies painting."</i></li> </ul> <b>Do not respond to the prompt but make a generalized comment</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>"Many people who aspire to be artists go to Paris to develop their talents."</i></li> </ul> <b>Describe the passage or features of the passage</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>"This passage focuses on the relationship between Mike and his painting teacher."</i></li> </ul>		<b>Examples that earn this point:</b> <b>Provide a defensible interpretation</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>"In 'One Morning in June,' Gallant's characterization of Mike suggests that he does understand what makes art successful even though he struggles to create it."</i></li> <li>• <i>"By portraying interactions with other characters in which Mike is entirely passive, Gallant has created a character who is himself the creation of others."</i></li> <li>• <i>"Although the narrator's descriptions make it clear that Mike is ignorant of the ways of the art world, Mike's thoughts and experiences show that he does have an artistic sense at heart."</i></li> </ul>
<b>Additional Notes:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The thesis may be more than one sentence, provided the sentences are in close proximity.</li> <li>• The thesis may be anywhere within the response.</li> <li>• For a thesis to be defensible, the passage must include at least minimal evidence that <i>could</i> be used to support that thesis; however, the student need not cite that evidence to earn the thesis point.</li> <li>• The thesis <i>may</i> establish a line of reasoning that structures the essay, but it needn't do so to earn the thesis point.</li> <li>• A thesis that meets the criteria can be awarded the point whether or not the rest of the response successfully supports that line of reasoning.</li> </ul>		

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria				
<b>Row B</b> <b>Evidence AND Commentary (0-4 points)</b>	<b>0 points</b> Simply restates thesis (if present), repeats provided information, or offers information irrelevant to the prompt.	<b>1 point</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides evidence that is mostly general.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Summarizes the evidence but does not explain how the evidence supports the student’s argument.	<b>2 points</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides some specific, relevant evidence.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Explains how some of the evidence relates to the student’s argument, but no line of reasoning is established, or the line of reasoning is faulty.	<b>3 points</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides specific evidence to support all claims in a line of reasoning.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Explains how some of the evidence supports a line of reasoning.  <b>AND</b> Explains how at least one literary element or technique in the passage contributes to its meaning.	<b>4 points</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides specific evidence to support all claims in a line of reasoning.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Consistently explains how the evidence supports a line of reasoning.  <b>AND</b> Explains how multiple literary elements or techniques in the passage contribute to its meaning.
<b>Decision Rules and Scoring Notes</b>					
<b>Typical responses that earn 0 points:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Are incoherent or do not address the prompt.</li> <li>May be just opinion with no textual references or references that are irrelevant.</li> </ul>	<b>Typical responses that earn 1 point:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Tend to focus on overarching narrative developments or description of a passage rather than specific details or techniques.</li> <li>Mention literary elements, devices, or techniques with little or no explanation.</li> </ul>	<b>Typical responses that earn 2 points:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consist of a mix of specific evidence and broad generalities.</li> <li>May contain some simplistic, inaccurate, or repetitive explanations that don’t strengthen the argument.</li> <li>May make one point well but either do not make multiple supporting claims or do not adequately support more than one claim.</li> <li>Do not explain the connections or progression between the student’s claims, so a line of reasoning is not clearly established.</li> </ul>	<b>Typical responses that earn 3 points:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Uniformly offer evidence to support claims.</li> <li>Focus on the importance of specific words and details from the passage to build an interpretation.</li> <li>Organize an argument as a line of reasoning composed of multiple supporting claims.</li> <li>Commentary may fail to integrate some evidence or fail to support a key claim.</li> </ul>	<b>Typical responses that earn 4 points:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Uniformly offer evidence to support claims.</li> <li>Focus on the importance of specific words and details from the passage to build an interpretation.</li> <li>Organize and support an argument as a line of reasoning composed of multiple supporting claims, each with adequate evidence that is clearly explained.</li> <li>Explain how the writer’s use of multiple literary techniques contributes to the student’s interpretation of the passage.</li> </ul>	
<b>Additional Notes:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Writing that suffers from grammatical and/or mechanical errors that interfere with communication cannot earn the fourth point in this row.</li> <li>To earn the fourth point in this row, the response may observe multiple instances of the same literary element or technique if each instance further contributes to the meaning of the passage.</li> </ul>					

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria	
<p><b>Row C</b> <b>Sophistication</b> <b>(0-1 points)</b></p>	<p><b>0 points</b> Does not meet the criteria for one point.</p>	<p><b>1 point</b> Demonstrates sophistication of thought and/or develops a complex literary argument.</p>
	<p><b>Decision Rules and Scoring Notes</b></p>	
	<p><b>Responses that do not earn this point:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Attempt to contextualize their interpretation, but such attempts consist predominantly of sweeping generalizations (“<i>Human experiences always include...</i>” OR “<i>In a world where...</i>” OR “<i>Since the beginning of time...</i>”).</li> <li>• Only hint at or suggest other possible interpretations (“<i>While another reader may see...</i>” OR “<i>Though the passage could be said to...</i>”).</li> <li>• Make a single statement about how an interpretation of the passage comments on something thematic without consistently maintaining that thematic interpretation.</li> <li>• Oversimplify complexities in the passage.</li> <li>• Use complicated or complex sentences or language that is ineffective because it does not enhance the student’s argument.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Responses that earn this point may demonstrate a sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument by doing any of the following:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Identifying and exploring complexities or tensions within the passage.</li> <li>2. Illuminating the student’s interpretation by situating it within a broader context.</li> <li>3. Accounting for alternative interpretations of the passage.</li> <li>4. Employing a style that is consistently vivid and persuasive.</li> </ol>
<p><b>Additional Notes:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This point should be awarded only if the sophistication of thought or complex understanding is part of the student’s argument, not merely a phrase or reference.</li> </ul>		

**Important:** Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

~~In Gallant's short story "One Morning in~~

Art, a pursuit that is creative, rule-breaking, and carefree, is represented as something else entirely in Gallant's short story "One Morning in June".

~~Mike's explanation of his art that~~ Gallant plays on the idea of what art truly is by making Mike pursue it in an unoriginal and strictly methodical manner, a reason for his overall confused and unsuccessful journey.

Mike begins his pursuit of art specifically by doing what his family ~~tells him~~ he is expected to do.

Mike goes to Paris, because the "words ~~art~~ "art" and "Paris" were unbreakably joined" even though "the legend of Trilby's Bohemia... had died" (Gallant 1-4).

~~Gallant~~. Instead of pursuing art in a way of his own passion, Mike placently goes to Paris, Gallant mocking him with the comparison of "exposing someone to a cure of measles and watching for spots to break out," which ~~intentionally~~ sounds reminiscent of a sort of science experiment. Gallant sets up the story by contrasting the passionate and original nature of art with ~~an~~ an unoriginal and unoriginal Mike, giving rise of his journey to be a difficult one.

Immediately, Gallant forces Mike to meet disappointment and begin his journey on the wrong foot, punishing

Page 5

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0259281



Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

The character for the unnamed reason for coming. Mike spends the "first three weeks standing in the wrong <sup>queue</sup> ~~line~~" and takes a class from a painter who is not even French, and whose nearsightedness demand Mike to create "paintings that I were large" (~~12-13~~ 12-13, 16-24). Mike is nihilist, ~~and in having~~ has <sup>Gallant</sup> to tailor his paintings to his teacher, and makes paintings devoid of people because "it was not in his nature to take chances" (Gallant 26-28). ~~Gallant~~ Mike's character is a complete contrast to one of a stereotypical painter, and with Gallant's ~~atypical~~ ~~uninspired~~ uninspired diction such as "wrong", "given up" and "empty". Mike's journey is so far characterized as a fruitless one. (Gallant, 13, 15, 26). Through Mike beginning this journey with the ~~the~~ wrong mindset and expectations, Gallant proves how simply following the whims of others can be detrimental.

Gallant expands on this not only with <sup>Mike's</sup> ~~the~~ mindset, but his attitude itself. His fear of experimentation results in "flat [and] empty" paintings, and his view of art itself is even strict and methodical (Gallant 34).

Mike, ~~enjoys~~ while growing to better enjoy art, enjoys it because of the "sense of separateness, the assembling of parts" (~~Gallant 42-43~~ Gallant, 42-43). Gallant's choice of diction creates a calculating and

Page 6

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

**Important:** Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

factory-like tone, against a contrast to what is the soul of art. He stresses over "time and money" like 'an American,' and this only begins to be combated as his teacher suggests he travel to a different place for better inspiration. Mike's attitude prevents him from truly finding any talent as an artist, leading to directionless and uninspired work.

Gallant's short story not ~~only~~ just ~~also~~ explores the right and wrong ways to approach art, but gives a warning to those unsure of what they want to pursue in life. Mike simply goes with the directions of others, and remains unfulfilled. Through this, Gallant's work provides a message to follow your own curved path, and listen to what you truly enjoy.

Page 7

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

Mo'vis Gallant's "One Morning in June" follows the emotionally nuanced experience of a student, Mike Cahill, who abandons a traditionally American path to success as a student in order to ~~develop~~ develop his talent for art. Throughout the short story, Gallant uses parentheses ~~to~~ to illustrate Mike's incessant yet uncontrasted self-doubt about his study, which ultimately prevents ~~Mike~~ Mike from properly exploring his talent.

Mike ~~describes~~ describes his paintings literally, but explains his motives behind each ~~specific~~ artistic choice in parentheses, displaying his lack of emphasis on his own thoughts. ~~For example,~~ The narrator explains, "His paintings were large (Mr. Chitterly was nearsighted), askew (as he had been taught in the public schools of New York) and empty of people (he had never been taught to draw, and it was not in his nature to take chances)." While Gallant uses free indirect discourse in this text, these <sup>reflections</sup> ~~are~~ can be described to Mike's consciousness because his paintings are being discussed. By viewing his own work and lamenting that "he had never been taught to draw," Mike expresses insecurity about his artwork. Additionally, by concluding that it ~~is~~ not in his nature to take chances," Mike illustrates his self-doubt regarding his decision to study art in the first place. However, both of these reflections being confined to parentheses ~~rather than~~, as if they are ~~not~~ necessary to understand the overall idea of the sentence, displays Mike's lack of acknowledgement of his insecurities.

Mike's ~~own~~ dismissal of his self-doubt ~~prevents~~ causes him to seek external excuses for abandoning

Page 4

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

● Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1    Question 2    Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

his study. When Mr. Chitterly ~~and~~ suggests to Mike that he "go to the country," Mike laments, "I can't afford it... I mean is it wasting time for me to paint, paint, paint?" Though Mike is insecure about his artistic ability, he uses the excuse of insufficient funds to quit his study in order to avoid confronting his self-doubt. However, Mr. Chitterly sees through this excuse, understanding that ~~that~~ what is really causing Mike's sudden desire to abandon his study is not a lack of "time and money" itself, but rather that Mike uses those traditional concepts as "measuring rods" for his success rather than focusing on his artistic talents.

Overall, Mike prevents himself from wholeheartedly exploring his talent for painting because ~~his~~ his refusal to confront his self-doubt, as displayed by Gallant's use of parentheses, causes him to generate external, less fixable <sup>reasons for</sup> ~~reasons for~~ abandoning his study.

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0083007





- **Important:** Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1    Question 2    Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

Most teens are unsure of their path after highschool, and many wish for time, time to try and experience, an opportunity which is bestowed upon the character Mike Cahill in Mavis Gallant's short story "One Morning in June". While many may think of this as a dream come true, Mike has many opposing feelings through this experience. The author develops Mike's complex experience and relationship with art through the use of metaphor and imagery.

The story begins describing the circumstances that led Mike to art, and immediately his feelings are summarized in the metaphor that sending him to Paris to study art felt "rather like exposing someone to a case of measles and watching for spots." (10). This sets the idea that Mike sees art as something thrown upon him, unwanted and negative. However, Mike's feelings evolve over time, as he learns the joys of art and finds comfort in the methodology of painting, using the metaphor of clocks and uniformity of mechanics to describe art. His perspective of art is much more negative initially, but through time his metaphor for art turns from disease to comfort and familiarity. Through the use of metaphor, Mike's complex and evolving experience of studying art is conveyed.

To further depict Mike's artistic journey, the author employs imagery to convey Mike's experience. The imagery that describes Mike's ~~ex~~ initial paintings is dreary, using terms such as "sober", "rain-soaked", "flat", and more words that conjure images of dullness. The use of this gray imagery works to portray how

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0284048



Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

Mike initially views art, as tiresome and uninteresting. Later on however, to support the development of Mike's complex ~~view~~ view on art, as he begins to enjoy it, the imagery switches to be lighter, more colorful and vibrant. The imagery of Mike seeing "every shade in a beam of light" contrasts his initial grey viewpoint and develops the complexity of his experience as he grows to love art. Towards the end, his teacher's recommendation to continue painting is paired with the image of "a paradise of lemon ice and sunshine," (67), using imagery to develop that Mike's whole perspective of art changed and it now is a bright opportunity for him. The imagery used helps portray the complex ~~character~~ feelings and development in Mike's experience with art.

Mike's complex experience with art is portrayed by the author through metaphor and imagery. While this story seems to focus on one youngman's plight to find himself, it is ~~a~~ just one version of a universally relatable struggle of youth, masterfully captured in Mike's artistic journey.

Page 6

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

The ~~the~~ desire for success is an ever-beating force in contrast to man's own desires. Humans go with what is expected over what is wanted. Human nature is the need to survive, the world runs on money, not fulfillment of the soul. In Mavis Gallant's short story "One morning in June" the seemingly impossible clash between the need for success and desire occurs in the mind of a young man. Decisions are made based on the views of the majority, not the fate of one's soul.

There has to be a purpose to everything. You become a doctor either to help or earn a tasteful living. What is the purpose of painting? Humans need constant hand holding. If no one is directly in your ear, saying your decisions are wise, then a man learns to doubt himself. "I mean is it wasting time for me to paint, paint, paint" (Gallant 61-62) said the confused young boy, and words similar spewing from the mouths of his peers. He shouldn't paint, he should become a doctor. Humans show their desires, yet they are always there, searching for a reason to be seen, to be acknowledged as something that matters.

Page 4

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

- **Important:** Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

Mike wanted a reason to paint. The usage of him questioning himself reflects the need for someone else to tell him his wishes are okay, and that he can go through with desire. Doing something you love changes how you see the world. Cahill paints the illusion of all gray paint, suddenly reflecting light. Life doesn't have to be gray, humans are not comfortable with the idea of free will. The path you take is up to you. You may earn lots when becoming a doctor but your gut will always find for something more than success. The repetition of "Paint" Gallant uses in Mike's dialogue represents the fact that Mike wants nothing more than to paint. To have a reason to paint. Why would mankind ever consider doing something without a reason?

Humans are animals of patterns. Majority do what is expected, and fulfill only what they are granted permission to do so. Life with success may be gray compared to a life with fulfilled desires, but that life is not always granted permission by daily onlookers. Onlookers who don't know your name, favorite color, they don't know the first thing about you. A life with dictation is not in your hands, but in

Page 5

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0299624



**Important:** Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

the hands OF the majority.

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3

Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

Painting is one of the best methods of expressing one's self or the world in one of the most creative manners. The problem with painting is that it needs fresh ideas and abundant creativity in order to properly convey what the artist desires. Marvin Gallant's short story "One Morning in June" expresses this idea of becoming a painter and having to find out how to properly express one's self. Gallant uses metaphor and emotional diction to show the journey Mike goes through learning painting in order to show that being a painter is not for everyone.

Gallant uses metaphor to show Mike's journey in order to show painting isn't for everyone. ~~Call back in the~~ Near the beginning of the excerpt, Mike's family show their desire for Mike to pursue painting. In Paris, this leads him to believe that their method was to "expose someone to ~~near~~ a case of measles and watch for spots to break out".

Page 4

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

## Question 2 – Prose Fiction Analysis

### Sample Identifier: A

Score: 1-4-1

#### A. Thesis Score: 1

- This essay provides an insightful analysis of how Mavis Gallant uses literary elements and techniques to convey a character’s complex experience of studying painting as described in the short story “One Morning in June.”
- The essay responds to the prompt with a thesis in the last sentence of paragraph 1: “Gallant plays on the idea of what art truly is by making Mike pursue it in an unoriginal and strictly methodical manner, a reason for his overall confused and unsuccessful journey.” The thesis presents a defensible interpretation; therefore, it earned the point in Row A.

#### B. Evidence Score: 4

- The essay provides specific evidence to support all claims in its line of reasoning, which focuses on Mike’s awkward and uncomfortable relationship with art. In paragraph 2, for example, the essay cites “the ‘words ‘art’ and ‘Paris’ were unbreakably joined...” as evidence that Mike goes to Paris because he does what he is supposed to do. Additionally, paragraph 3 presents the argument that “Mike’s character is a complete contrast to one of a stereotypical painter, and with Gallant’s uninspiring diction such as ‘wrong,’ ‘given up,’ and ‘empty,’ Mike’s journey is so far characterized as a fruitless one.” In paragraph 4, the response offers the evidence that Mike’s “fear of experimentation results in ‘flat [and] empty’ paintings” and that Mike enjoys art because of the “sense of separateness, the assembling of parts.”
- The commentary woven through the essay clearly explains how the evidence provided supports the line of reasoning. For example, in paragraph 3, the response points out “Immediately, Gallant forces Mike to meet disappointment and begin his journey on the wrong foot, punishing the character for the unoriginal reason for coming. Mike spends the ‘first three weeks standing in the wrong queue’ and takes a class from a painter who is not even French, and whose nearsightedness demand Mike to create ‘paintings [that] were large.’” Additionally, at the end of paragraph 4, the essay offers the commentary “Mike’s attitude prevents him from truly finding any talent as an artist, leading to a directionless and uninspired work.” This commentary strengthens the claim that Mike has an uneasy relationship with art.
- The essay considers the role of literary elements such as diction, contrast, and tone, analyzing their role in the passage. In paragraph 4, for example, the essay suggests “Gallant’s choice of diction creates a calculating and factory-like tone, again a contrast to what is the soul of art.” This combination of precise evidence, consistent commentary, and thoughtful explanation of the literary elements’ contributions to the meaning of the passage results in the essay earning 4 points in Row B.

### **C. Sophistication Score: 1**

- This essay earned 1 point in Row C due to its identification and exploration of the complexities and tensions within the passage. The response examines a contrast between a natural pursuit of art and Mike’s approach to art in multiple places throughout the essay. For example, the first sentence of the essay characterizing “Art, a pursuit that is creative, rule-breaking, and carefree” contrasts with the observation at the end of paragraph 4, “Mike’s attitude prevents him from truly finding any talent as an artist, leading to directionless and uninspired work.” Because the essay demonstrates sophistication of thought, it earned 1 point in Row C.

### **Sample Identifier: B**

**Score: 1-4-0**

#### **A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This essay cogently examines how, in the short story “One Morning in June,” Mavis Gallant uses a specific literary element to convey Mike’s complex experience of studying painting.
- The essay offers a defensible interpretation of the passage in paragraph 1, where it states, “Throughout the short story, Gallant uses parentheses to illustrate Mike’s incessant yet unconflicted self-doubt about his study, which ultimately prevents Mike from properly exploring his talent.” The essay earned 1 point in Row A.

#### **B. Evidence Score: 4**

- The essay establishes a line of reasoning that focuses on Mike’s lack of confidence and resistance to taking risks. The essay provides specific evidence to develop and support this line of reasoning through examples such as the one found in paragraph 2: “The narrator explains, ‘His paintings were large (Mr. Chitterly was nearsighted), askew (as he had been taught in the public schools of New York) and empty of people (he had never been taught to draw, and it was not in his nature to take chances).’” The essay focuses in more depth on the statement “he had never been taught to draw,” and suggests that through it, “Mike expresses insecurity about his artwork.”
- The commentary consistently explains how the evidence supports the line of reasoning, as in paragraph 3 where the commentary explains Mike’s lament, “I can’t afford it” by stating, “Though Mike is insecure about his artistic ability, he uses the excuse of insufficient funds to quit his study in order to avoid confronting this self doubt.”
- The response focuses on one literary device, parentheses, and provides multiple instances of how they contribute to the meaning of the passage. In paragraph 2, the response contends that “both of these reflections being confined to parentheses, as if they are unnecessary to understand the overall idea of the sentence, displays Mike’s lack of acknowledgement of his insecurities” (paragraph 2). Because the essay provides specific evidence, consistently explains how that evidence supports the line of reasoning, and explains how parentheses contribute meaning to the passage, the essay earned 4 points in Row B.



### **C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- While the argument presented in the essay is persuasive, it does not rise to the level of complexity required to earn the point in Row C. The essay does not demonstrate sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument.

### **Sample Identifier: C**

**Score: 1-3-0**

#### **A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This essay analyzes how Mavis Gallant uses literary elements and techniques to explain Mike’s experience of studying art in Paris in the short story “One Morning in June.”
- The response addresses the prompt with a defensible interpretation of the passage in paragraph 1, where it states, “While many may think of this as a dream come true, Mike has many opposing feelings through this experience.” The essay earned 1 point in Row A.

#### **B. Evidence Score: 3**

- The essay provides specific evidence from the passage to support its line of reasoning that focuses on Mike’s evolving relationship with art. In paragraph 2, for example, the essay points out that the metaphor “sending him to Paris to study art felt ‘rather like exposing someone to a case of measles and watching for spots’” establishes “the idea that Mike sees art as something thrown upon him.” Later in paragraph 3, the response offers the evidence “The imagery of Mike seeing ‘every shade in a beam of light’ contrasts his initial grey viewpoint and develops the complexity of his experience as he grows to love art.”
- The commentary explains how some of the evidence supports the line of reasoning. For example, in paragraph 2, the response states, “However, Mike’s feelings evolve over time, as he learns the joy of art and finds comfort in the methodology of painting...” and “His perspective of art is much more negative initially, but through time his metaphor for art turns from disease to comfort and familiarity.” The response does not, however, effectively integrate the evidence of “the image of lemon ice and sunshine” (paragraph 3) into the claim that Mike’s feelings have changed because the memory belongs to Mr. Chitterly, not to Mike.
- The response focuses on Gallant’s use of imagery and metaphor and how they contribute to the meaning of the passage, such as in paragraph 2: “using the metaphor of clocks and uniformity of mechanics to describe art.” In paragraph 3, the essay points out that “the imagery switches to be lighter, more colorful and vibrant.” Because the essay provides specific evidence, explains how some of that evidence supports the line of reasoning, and explains how literary elements contribute to its meaning, the essay earned 3 points in Row B.

### **C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- Although the essay briefly attempts to contextualize its interpretation in paragraph 1 (“Most teens are unsure of their path after high school...”), the attempt is broad. The

essay does not demonstrate sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument; therefore, it did not earn the point in Row C.

**Sample Identifier: D**

**Score: 1-2-0**

**A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This essay endeavors to analyze Mike’s complex experience of studying painting as described in Mavis Gallant’s short story “One Morning in June.”
- The response offers a defensible interpretation of the passage in paragraph 1, where it states, “In Mavis Gallant’s short story ‘One Morning in June’ the seemingly impossible clash between the need for success and desire occurs in the mind of a young man.” This response to the prompt earned 1 point in Row A.

**B. Evidence Score: 2**

- While this essay offers some specific evidence, it also contains simplistic explanations and generalizations. The evidence that is offered in paragraph 2, “‘I mean is it wasting my time for me to paint, paint, paint’ (Gallant 61-62) said the confused young boys” is brief and not connected to the thesis. No line of reasoning is established within the essay, and the generalizations such as “There has to be a purpose to everything” (paragraph 2) and “Humans need constant hand holding” (paragraph 2) inhibit the essay’s attempt to make a clear and specific argument.
- The essay attempts to explain how one piece of evidence relates to the interpretation when it states in paragraph 3, “The repetition of ‘Paint’ Gallant uses in Mike’s dialogue represents the fact that Mike wants nothing more than to paint.” The commentary here also mentions a literary element but does not explain how it contributes to the meaning of the passage. Because little evidence is provided and the commentary does not explain the connections or progression between the student’s claims, this essay earned 2 points in Row B.

**C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- The essay does not demonstrate sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument. It earned 0 points in Row C.

**Sample Identifier: E**

**Score: 1-1-0**

**A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This brief essay attempts to explain how Mavis Gallant conveys Mike’s complex experience of studying painting in her short story, “One Morning in June.”
- The essay’s thesis, “Gallant uses metaphor and emotional diction to show the journey Mike goes through learning painting in order to show that being a painter is not for

everyone,” appears in paragraph 1. Because it responds to the prompt with a defensible interpretation of the passage, it earned 1 point in Row A.

**B. Evidence Score: 1**

- The response presents evidence that is largely general; for example, in paragraph 2, the essay offers the observation “Mike’s family show their desire for Mike to pursue painting.” The final sentence of the essay offers one piece of direct evidence, “This leads him to believe that their method was to ‘expose someone to a case of measles and watch for spots to break out.’” This evidence is not clearly connected to the thesis, and no line of reasoning is established within the response.
- The commentary offered is scant: “Gallant uses metaphor to show Mike’s journey in order to show painting isn’t for everyone” (paragraph 2) and falls into generalization. While one literary element, metaphor, is mentioned, its role in the passage is unclear. For these reasons, the essay earned 1 point in Row B.

**C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- The response does not demonstrate sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument and did not, therefore, earn the point in Row C.

**Question 3**

(Suggested time—40 minutes. This question counts as one-third of the total essay section score.)

Many works of literature feature a character who may be reluctant to make a decision, unable to make a decision, or is resistant to doing so. This indecision can have broader implications for that character or other characters. Such implications may include changes to a character’s relationships, social and/or financial stability, well-being, or any other aspects of the character’s existence.

Either from your own reading or from the list below, choose a work of fiction in which a character delays or avoids making a decision. Then, in a well-written essay, analyze how the impact of this indecision contributes to an interpretation of the work as a whole. Do not merely summarize the plot.

In your response you should do the following:

- Respond to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation.
- Provide evidence to support your line of reasoning.
- Explain how the evidence supports your line of reasoning.
- Use appropriate grammar and punctuation in communicating your argument.

*The Age of Innocence*  
*An American Marriage*  
*Anna Karenina*  
*The Autobiography of Miss Jane Pittman*  
*Beloved*  
*Colorless Tsukuru Tazaki and His Years of Pilgrimage*  
*Corelli’s Mandolin*  
*Dubliners*  
*Emma*  
*Frankenstein*  
*George Washington Gómez*  
*Indian Horse*  
*Interior Chinatown*  
*Jane Eyre*  
*The Kite Runner*  
*Little Fires Everywhere*  
*A Long Petal of the Sea*  
*Love in the Time of Cholera*  
*Madame Bovary*

*The Metamorphosis*  
*The Miraculous Day of Amalia Gómez*  
*The Namesake*  
*The Night Watchman*  
*North and South*  
*One Flew Over the Cuckoo’s Nest*  
*Pipeline*  
*The Professor’s House*  
*Quicksand*  
*A Raisin in the Sun*  
*Rebecca*  
*A Room with a View*  
*The Stranger*  
*A Tale of Two Cities*  
*Tess of the d’Urbervilles*  
*Topdog/Underdog*  
*Waiting*  
*Whereabouts*  
*Wuthering Heights*

---

**Begin your response to this question at the top of a new page in the separate Free Response booklet and fill in the appropriate circle at the top of each page to indicate the question number.**

**Question 3: Literary Argument****6 points**

Many works of literature feature a character who may be reluctant to make a decision, unable to make a decision, or is resistant to doing so. This indecision can have broader implications for that character or other characters. Such implications may include changes to a character's relationships, social and/or financial stability, well-being, or any other aspects of the character's existence.

Either from your own reading or from the list below, choose a work of fiction in which a character delays or avoids making a decision. Then, in a well-written essay, analyze how the impact of this indecision contributes to an interpretation of the work as a whole. Do not merely summarize the plot.

In your response, you should do the following:

- Respond to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation.
- Provide evidence to support your line of reasoning.
- Explain how the evidence supports your line of reasoning.
- Use appropriate grammar and punctuation in communicating your argument.

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria	
<p><b>Row A</b> <b>Thesis</b> <b>(0-1 points)</b></p>	<p><b>0 points</b></p> <p>For any of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There is no defensible thesis.</li> <li>• The intended thesis only restates the prompt.</li> <li>• The intended thesis provides a summary of the issue with no apparent or coherent claim.</li> <li>• There is a thesis, but it does not respond to the prompt.</li> </ul>	<p><b>1 point</b></p> <p>Responds to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation of the selected work.</p>
<b>Decision Rules and Scoring Notes</b>		
<p><b>Responses that do not earn this point:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Only restate the prompt.</li> <li>• Make a generalized comment about the selected work that doesn't respond to the prompt.</li> </ul>		<p><b>Responses that earn this point:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provide a defensible interpretation of the impact of a character's indecision.</li> </ul> <p>OR</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Make a claim about how the impact of a character's indecision contributes to an interpretation of the work as a whole.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Examples that do not earn this point:</b></p> <p><b>Restate the prompt</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>"Decisions are often hard to make. In literature, some characters can't or won't make a decision, and this affects them or the people around them."</i></li> </ul> <p><b>Do not respond to the prompt but make a generalized comment about the selected work</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>"Characters often make mistakes in literature. Victor Frankenstein allows himself to get swept up in misguided ideas."</i></li> <li>• <i>"Delaying a decision is often easier than confronting a problem. Many works of literature involve characters who have difficult decisions to make."</i></li> <li>• <i>"Many of the decisions made in <u>Madame Bovary</u> are made out of boredom."</i></li> </ul>		<p><b>Examples that earn this point:</b></p> <p><b>Provides a defensible interpretation</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>"Hamlet's prideful inability to decide whether or how to enact revenge on his uncle results in his own downfall."</i></li> <li>• <i>"In <u>The Catcher in the Rye</u>, Holden is frequently indecisive about what he wants from his life. This indecision serves to advance his characterization as an innocent person in a world full of what he calls 'phonies.'"</i></li> <li>• <i>"In <u>Wuthering Heights</u>, the conflict between Heathcliff's love for Catherine and his own pride render him unable to either move on from her or confess his love. His indecision haunts him both figuratively and literally, and Catherine's ghost acts as a constant reminder of his failure."</i></li> </ul>
<p><b>Additional Notes:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The thesis may be more than one sentence, provided the sentences are in close proximity.</li> <li>• The thesis may be anywhere within the response.</li> <li>• A thesis that offers a defensible claim about the impact of a character's indecision in the selected work may earn the point; any reasonable student interpretation of "indecision" is acceptable.</li> <li>• For a thesis to be defensible, the selected work must include at least minimal evidence that <i>could</i> be used to support that thesis; however, the student need not cite that evidence to earn the thesis point.</li> <li>• The thesis <i>may</i> establish a line of reasoning that structures the essay, but it needn't do so to earn the thesis point.</li> <li>• A thesis that meets the criteria can be awarded the point whether or not the rest of the response successfully supports that line of reasoning.</li> </ul>		

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria				
<b>Row B</b> <b>Evidence</b> <b>AND</b> <b>Commentary</b> <b>(0-4 points)</b>	<b>0 points</b> Simply restates thesis (if present), repeats provided information, or offers information irrelevant to the prompt.	<b>1 point</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides evidence that is mostly general.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Summarizes the evidence but does not explain how the evidence supports the argument.	<b>2 points</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides some specific, relevant evidence.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Explains how some of the evidence relates to the student’s argument, but no line of reasoning is established, or the line of reasoning is faulty.	<b>3 points</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides specific evidence to support all claims in a line of reasoning.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Explains how some of the evidence supports a line of reasoning.	<b>4 points</b> <b>EVIDENCE:</b> Provides specific evidence to support all claims in a line of reasoning.  <b>AND</b> <b>COMMENTARY:</b> Consistently explains how the evidence supports a line of reasoning.
<b>Decision Rules and Scoring Notes</b>					
<b>Typical responses that earn 0 points:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Are incoherent or do not address the prompt.</li> <li>• May be just opinion with no textual references or references that are irrelevant.</li> </ul>	<b>Typical responses that earn 1 point:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Tend to focus on overarching narrative developments or description of a selected work rather than specific details.</li> </ul>	<b>Typical responses that earn 2 points:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Consist of a mix of specific evidence and broad generalities.</li> <li>• May contain some simplistic, inaccurate, or repetitive explanations that don’t strengthen the argument.</li> <li>• May make one point well but either do not make multiple supporting claims or do not adequately support more than one claim.</li> <li>• Do not explain the connections or progression between the student’s claims, so a line of reasoning is not clearly established.</li> </ul>	<b>Typical responses that earn 3 points:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Uniformly offer evidence to support claims.</li> <li>• Focus on the importance of specific details from the selected work to build an interpretation.</li> <li>• Organize an argument as a line of reasoning composed of multiple supporting claims.</li> <li>• Commentary may fail to integrate some evidence or fail to support a key claim.</li> </ul>	<b>Typical responses that earn 4 points:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Uniformly offer evidence to support claims.</li> <li>• Focus on the importance of specific details from the selected work to build an interpretation.</li> <li>• Organize and support an argument as a line of reasoning composed of multiple supporting claims, each with adequate evidence that is clearly explained.</li> </ul>	
<b>Additional Notes:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Writing that suffers from grammatical and/or mechanical errors that interfere with communication cannot earn the fourth point in this row.</li> <li>• To earn the fourth point in this row, the response must address the interpretation of the selected work as a whole.</li> </ul>					

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria	
<b>Row C</b> <b>Sophistication</b> <b>(0-1 points)</b>	<b>0 points</b> Does not meet the criteria for one point.	<b>1 point</b> Demonstrates sophistication of thought and/or develops a complex literary argument.
	<b>Decision Rules and Scoring Notes</b>	
	<b>Responses that do not earn this point:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Attempt to contextualize their interpretation, but such attempts consist predominantly of sweeping generalizations (“<i>Human experiences always include...</i>” OR “<i>In a world where...</i>” OR “<i>Since the beginning of time...</i>”).</li> <li>• Only hint at or suggest other possible interpretations (“<i>While another reader may see...</i>” OR “<i>Though the text could be said to...</i>”).</li> <li>• Oversimplify complexities of the topic and/or the selected work.</li> <li>• Use complicated or complex sentences or language that is ineffective because it does not enhance the student’s argument.</li> </ul>	<b>Responses that earn this point may demonstrate a sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument by doing any of the following:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Identifying and exploring complexities or tensions within the selected work.</li> <li>2. Illuminating the student’s interpretation by situating it within a broader context.</li> <li>3. Accounting for alternative interpretations of the text.</li> <li>4. Employing a style that is consistently vivid and persuasive.</li> </ol>
<b>Additional Notes:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This point should be awarded only if the sophistication of thought or complex understanding is part of the student’s argument, not merely a phrase or reference.</li> </ul>		





Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

will stay and he calls Cheché by his American name, Chester. This is the first time that the decision all over steps toward modernization leads to conflict in the factory, and Ofelia referring to Cheché as "Chester" serves to convey once again his symbol as being more American than Cuban and differentiates him based on his cultural heritage. As the decision of whether to modernize continues to get drawn out as Santiago finds it difficult to put his foot down and make a decision, tensions continue to rise in the factory. The growing tension comes to a head when Cheché ~~arrives~~ bursts into the factory while Juan Julian is reading to the workers and shoots Juan Julian, killing him. This ~~with~~ grotesque act of violence by Cheché suggests a symbolic attack on traditional values by American industry, with Cheché - the American capitalist - shooting Juan Julian - the Cuban lector who served as a direct tie to the culture the factory grew out of. This act of violence - and all the tension leading up to it illustrates the failure of Santiago, as if he had made a decision and been firm with Cheché earlier in the play, there may have been a chance for cohabitation of the differing cultural and economic views.

Despite the violent results of Santiago's ~~inability~~ to make resistance to make a decision and be firm with Cheché, the events do lead to an opposite effect on various other characters in the play, with the bonds of some growing stronger as a result of the intense turmoil. In particular, ~~the~~ the relationship of Pulmon and Conchita had seemed to be on the rocks, with Juan Julian ~~and~~ Conchita cheating on her husband with Juan Julian.

Page 8

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0024816



● **Important:** Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

In fact, when the factory holds a vote as to whether they should keep Juan Julian or remove the lector to save money, Palomo is the only worker in the factory to vote with Cheche that Juan Julian should be fired. This break with not only Conchita but also his entire cultural heritage for Palomo illustrates the destructive results of the decision over whether to modernize. However, it also provides a basis on which Palomo and Conchita are able to rebuild their relationship, as they weather the storm and become closer ~~in~~ because of it. After Juan Julian's murder, Palomo is tasked with ~~reading the final passage~~ finishing the section of Anna Karenina from which Juan Julian had been reading. ~~and~~ Palomo reads aloud about the importance of choosing to react to difficult relationships in a measured way and with love and gratitude rather than animosity, sharing a meaningful look with Conchita as he absorbs the meaning of what he's speaking aloud. This interaction between Conchita and Palomo to conclude the play shows how even when all may seem lost, you can rediscover what is most important. Although Santiago's indecision leads to many negative consequences for the factory, there is also immense growth that occurs as a result of the events which would not have been possible if not for Santiago's resistance to decide unilaterally whether or not to modernize.

The choice Santiago has of whether to move the factory toward American culture or retain their Cuban cultural heritage leads to not only strife between characters as they fight for what they believe in, but also growth of understanding between them

Page 9

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

as they are given the chance to reevaluate what is most important. Where we come from greatly affects both who we are and what we believe is correct, altering not only our perspective but also the lives of those around us through the decisions we make, and also the ones we do not.

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0024816



● **Important:** Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

In the novel "The Song of Solomon" by Toni Morrison, Milkman, through the indifference and carelessness of his life decisions, prolongs supplementing his life with meaning instead of merely existing.

Initially, Milkman is born into a wealthy, influential family, and by inheritance, his reputation was already established before he was born. Furthermore, this set the precedence for his development as, for the majority of his life until the age of forty-five, he would have every privilege handed to him and challenge removed. The inheritance of his father's business, his mother's ~~secto~~ obscure behavior and his sister's insignificance ~~approac~~ funded his indifference towards ~~eer~~ the political makeup of the world and the discord present between him and his family, and him and his community. Milkman, within his own sphere, was merely living; this indifference to all other things around him, ~~kickstarted~~ generated rifts in his relationships, thus kickstarting his call-to-action.

As stated, the rifts he made with others was founded on the impassionate and egocentric attitude he displayed to other people. ~~His intimate relationship with Hagar was~~ He was detached from his intimate relationship with Hagar, who poured her passion and attention into Milkman, only to have stomped out and nonreflective. Furthermore, his sisters, who he lived with until he was in his forties, seemed insignificant through his lens, even though, sometimes their entire purpose was to appease. He acted out of concern for himself, and not for

Page 7

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

the wellbeing of other people who loved him. Consequently, these relationships, and many of his others, dwindled. He became ~~unlikeable~~ ~~embodiment~~ a burden to his family members and an obstacle to his community. His indifference caused him to neglect people which, after several decades, allowed him to finally realize it was the keystone to all his problems. Though the 'coming of age' moment to most fictional characters come between the ages of eight and fifteen, Milkman had his 'coming of age' moment in his forties.

~~Within this moment, he decided to~~

After this realization, Milkman decides to start living instead of just existing as he sets out on his own to ~~indecipher~~ <sup>establish</sup> his own freedom. Though, on his journey to obtain lost treasure, he is unsuccessful but, he discovers the origin of his family's discord. For the first time, Milkman learned to love people, give to others, and be selfless towards those who cared about him. This shift in character ~~dramatic~~ presented the ~~the~~ contrast in what his life could've been the entire time he's existed to what it had been. For decades, this indecision to start living ~~caused~~ <sup>caused</sup> the destruction of his relationships and the disconnection of his family.

In the end, Milkman directed his attention toward his problems instead of away from them, as he sacrificed himself for the general wellbeing of others. Moreover, this series of events contributes to the interpretations ~~of~~ <sup>of</sup> that, "it's never too late to change" and, "indifference is a leading cause of evil and

Page 8

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0287478



● **Important:** Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

destruction. ~~Through~~ the contrast of beauty presented in Milkman's acquired character compared to the ~~arrogant~~ indifference of his inherited one, suggests that the result of the novel could have been much different, given that he showed ~~care to people~~ compassion and emotional reflection to those that showed it first.

Page 9

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

In William Shakespeare's "King Lear" we see an ~~expanded~~ expanded indecision of truly giving up power from the main antagonist King Lear. He creates an elongated process of giving up his King-hood instead of doing it all at once, which leads to a tragic downfall of the Kingdom, family hood, and sanity.

King Lear creates a tragic downfall upon the Kingdom by first leaving his reign of power, and dividing it up among his daughters, Goneril and Regan, after a false procession of love for him. When this happens, Lear banishes his third daughter and his servant, ~~at the~~ ~~time~~ who were the only two honest and loyal people to him. This creates a decline in the Kingdom's wellbeing as well as Lear's because the Kingdom is now lead by ~~liars~~ liars and power-seekers and Lear lost the only ~~the~~ understanding, helpful people for him. Providing that Lear left his reign as King, we begin to see a downfall amongst relationships, the Kingdom, and his sanity.

King Lear also creates a mess between familial bonds. His fatherhood is no longer respected by his oldest daughters who push him away from the Kingdom and want him dead. This decision not only affected his relationships, but others as well. Cordelia has no family anymore after being banished away from her father and sisters. Lastly, he creates a broken bond between him and Kent, who is similar to family in his eyes, as he has loyally served Lear for ages. This creates not only familial hardship,

Page 6

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.



● **Important:** Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

but also a deep cut in Lear's sanity.

King Lear throughout the play loses much of his sanity, ~~the~~ as well as many other characters due to Lear's choices. Edgar, who ends up being hunted by people due to his brother's illegitimacy, becomes a "Poor Tom", ~~with~~ <sup>keeping</sup> a disguised appearance at all times. Gloucester and Regan lose their sanity for Lear, as he has caused so much drama and affliction throughout the play. Lear, finally, loses all his sanity at the end of the play when he sees his daughter pass in his arms, after he banished her for being loyal + honest with him.

In conclusion, King Lear's ~~failure~~ ~~to~~ failure to truly let go of power, caused many downfalls among those around him. Including his family, his kingdom, his relationships, and himself. ~~Proving~~ ~~that~~ ~~proving~~ ~~you're~~ ~~better~~ ~~off~~ ~~letting~~ ~~go~~ ~~when~~ ~~something~~ ~~no~~ ~~longer~~ ~~serves~~ ~~you~~. ~~Proving~~ ~~you're~~ ~~better~~ ~~off~~ ~~letting~~ ~~go~~ ~~when~~ ~~something~~ ~~no~~ ~~longer~~ ~~serves~~ ~~you~~.

Page 7

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

In Mary Shelley's novel Frankenstein, Victor Frankenstein's indecision to make a second monster as companion for his first monster leads the monster to commit ~~the~~ vicious acts as a means of revenge.

Victor Frankenstein's indecision brings trouble for him and his family. After a brief stay with the people in the village and ~~the~~ receiving warmth from the blind man, the monster requests ~~Victor~~ Victor Frankenstein ~~to~~ to create another monster so that he is able to have a companion. ~~The~~ The monster promises Frankenstein that he will move somewhere far with his partner, away from human society. At first, Victor Frankenstein agrees to create another monster, however, after he creates the monster's head, he destroys the monster as he is terrified of the idea of having two frightening monsters roaming the Earth. Upon hearing this, the monster becomes angry and tries to seek revenge, in which he frames Justine for the death of William, her little brother, which causes ~~her~~ the people in town to think she is a witch and kills her. He also threatens Victor Frankenstein that he will be on his wedding day. Victor Frankenstein's indecision causes the monster to act irrationally, which includes harming innocent individuals. When Frankenstein ~~tries~~ tries to escape from his responsibilities as the creator and ~~parental~~ parental figure of the monster, he brings harm to himself and his family as he continues to neglect the monster due to his ~~horrid~~ grotesque appearance. In addition, when he finally denies the monster's chance of experiencing love like how he saw humans have, he also crushes his hopes of becoming a normal member of society, instead of ~~be~~ a deviation due to his appearance. Frankenstein's indecision shatters the monster's dreams and makes him hateful towards

Page 8

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0224094



● Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

his creator as he feels ~~like~~ a sense of mistreatment and inequality.  
~~the~~ this passionate hatred turns into violence when the monster kills  
Frankenstein's family members ~~to try to~~ in an attempt to make Frankenstein  
pay attention to him. Frankenstein's indecision brings ~~both himself and~~  
harm to both himself and ~~the rest of~~ his dearest family.

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.



- Important: Completely fill in the circle that corresponds to the question you are answering on this page.

Question 1

Question 2

Question 3



Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

In "Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde", Dr. Jekyll's inability to make decisions in the end results in his death. Some may even say that Dr. Jekyll's inability to make decisions was the reason for the entire book ~~tragedy~~ in the first place.

Dr. Jekyll a well respected + honorable doctor (scientist) is faced with a dilemma throughout the book. Before the beginning of the book Dr. Jekyll has always struggled with his image + dark side. So, he creates a potion that creates Mr. Hyde (his evil twin if you will). From this point ~~on~~ on, every decision he (Dr. Jekyll) makes ~~brings him closer or doesn't make, to~~ brings him ~~closer or further~~ towards his fate.

Dr. Jekyll in+ of himself is not a bad person + b/c of that he struggles a lot with his evil urges. And so he suppresses those ~~evil~~ urges for so long until Mr. Hyde ~~is~~ appeared. and ~~fulfills~~ did them. And because of that a burden lifted off + Dr. Jekyll become attached to Mr. Hyde.

Page 5

Use a pen with black or dark blue ink only. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

0334208



**Question 3 – Literary Argument****Sample Identifier: A****Score: 1-4-1****A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This compelling essay thoroughly examines the significance of Santiago’s indecision as to whether to modernize his factory as depicted in Nilo Cruz’s play, *Anna in the Tropics*.
- The essay responds to the prompt with a thesis that appears in the introductory paragraph: “Santiago is the owner of the factory, and his resistance to making a decision regarding whether or not to modernize his cigar factory causes strife with many of those around him, but eventually leads several characters to reevaluate their relationships for the better. Through this, Cruz explores the idea that it is our cultural heritage that most significantly impacts our unique interpretations of the American Dream.” This thesis presents a defensible interpretation of the play; therefore, the essay earned 1 point in Row A.

**B. Evidence Score: 4**

- The response provides a wealth of specific evidence to support all claims in its line of reasoning, which focuses on the positive and negative implications of the decisions about modernization for the community members and their culture. In paragraph 2, for example, the essay points out that while Cheché believes employing a lector to read to the factory workers is a “waste of money,” Santiago’s wife Ofelia “asserts that Juan Julian will stay and calls Cheché by his American name, Chester.” Ofelia’s act “serves to convey once again his symbol as being more American than Cuban and differentiates him based on his cultural heritage” and is offered as evidence of the claim that culture influences the interpretation of the American Dream. The response further connects this evidence to the line of reasoning about Santiago’s indecision by explaining that “As the decision of whether to modernize continues to get drawn out as Santiago finds it difficult to put his foot down and make a decision, tensions continue to rise in the factory.” Another implication of Santiago’s lack of decisiveness is identified in paragraph 3, where the essay describes “After Juan Julian’s murder, Paloma is tasked with finishing the section of *Anna Karenina* from which Juan Julian had been reading. Paloma reads aloud about the importance of choosing to react to difficult relationships in a measured way and with love and gratitude rather than animosity, sharing a meaningful look with Conchita as he absorbs the meaning of what he is speaking aloud.” This evidence supports the claim that positive growth can result from negative consequences.
- The essay provides cogent commentary that consistently relates the evidence to the line of reasoning, such as in paragraph 3, where the response considers the significance of the meaningful look between Conchita and Paloma: “This interaction between Conchita and Paloma to conclude the play shows how even when all may seem lost, you can rediscover what is most important. Although Santiago’s indecision leads to many negative consequences for the factory, there is also immense growth that occurs as a result of the events which would not have been possible if not for Santiago’s resistance to decide unilaterally whether or not to modernize.” Because this essay focuses on the importance

of specific details from the play to build an interpretation and organizes and supports a clear line of reasoning, it earned 4 points in Row B.

### **C. Sophistication Score: 1**

- This response earned 1 point in Row C because it demonstrates sophistication in two ways. First, it develops a complex literary argument through its explorations of tensions about culture and modernization that are portrayed in the play. For example, the essay contends in paragraph 2 that “This initial difference between the two and Cheché’s focus on money combine to illustrate Cheché as not only a foil to Santiago’s indecisiveness, but also a symbol of the unrelentingly aggressive nature of American capitalism.” Secondly, the essay employs a style that is consistently vivid and persuasive, as seen in the sentence, “This grotesque act of violence by Cheché suggests a symbolic attack on traditional values by American industry, with Cheché—the American capitalist—shooting Juan Julian—the Cuban lector who served as a direct tie to the culture the factory grew out of” (paragraph 2).

### **Sample Identifier: B**

**Score: 1-4-0**

#### **A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This insightful essay analyzes how indecision affects the life of the character Milkman and his family as portrayed in *Song of Solomon* by Toni Morrison.
- The response offers a defensible interpretation of the novel when it states at the end of paragraph 4, “For decades, this indecision to start living sourced the destruction of his relationships and the disconnection of his family.” The essay earned 1 point in Row A.

#### **B. Evidence Score: 4**

- The essay develops a line of reasoning that focuses on the claim that Milkman’s indifference and indecision stem from his familial privilege and wealth. The response offers specific evidence to support all claims in this argument. For example, in paragraph 2, the response suggests, “The inheritance of his father’s business, his mother’s obscure behavior and his sister’s insignificance founded his indifference towards the political makeup of the world and the discord present between him and his family, and him and his community.” Additionally, in paragraph 4, another example cites, “on his journey to obtain lost treasure, he is unsuccessful but, he discovers the origin of his family’s discord. For the first time, Milkman learned to love people, give to others, and be selfless towards those who cared about him.” This evidence supports the claim that Milkman’s decision to begin living his own life away from his family results not only in his freedom but also in the development of his “compassion and emotional reflection to those that showed it first” (paragraph 5).
- The commentary in the essay consistently explains how the evidence supports the line of reasoning, such as in the second paragraph where the response states, “Milkman, within his own sphere, was merely living; this indifference to all other things around him, generated rifts in his relationships, thus kickstarting his call-to-action.” Additionally, paragraph 4 ends with the commentary, “For decades, this indecision to start living

sourced the destruction of his relationships and the disconnection of his family.” The essay organizes and supports its argument as a line of reasoning composed of multiple claims, each with adequate evidence that is clearly explained; therefore, the essay earned 4 points in Row B.

### **C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- The response, while perceptive, does not demonstrate sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument because it hints at complexities that are not fully developed, such as in the final paragraph where it states, “The contrast of beauty presented in Milkman’s acquired character compared to the indifference of his inherited one, suggests that the result of the novel could have been much different.” The essay did not, therefore, earn a point in Row C.

### **Sample Identifier: C**

**Score: 1-3-0**

#### **A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This essay analyzes how King Lear’s indecision about his role as king affects both his kingdom and his family as portrayed in the tragedy by William Shakespeare.
- The response provides a defensible interpretation of the impact of Lear’s indecision in the first paragraph where it states, “In William Shakespeare’s ‘King Lear’ we see an expanded indecision of truly giving up power from the main antagonist King Lear. He creates an elongated process of giving up his king-hood instead of doing it all, at once, which leads to a tragic downfall of the kingdom, family hood, and sanity.” The essay earned 1 point in Row A.

#### **B. Evidence Score: 3**

- The response provides specific evidence from the play to support a line of reasoning that focuses on the logical progression of the results of Lear’s indecision about his legacy. In paragraph 3, for example, the essay offers three specific pieces of evidence that support the claim that “King Lear also creates a mess between familial bonds.” The essay cites, “His fatherhood is no longer respected by his oldest daughters who push him away from the kingdom and want him dead,” “Cordelia has no family anymore after being banished away from her father and sisters,” and “a broken bond between him and Kent, who is similar to family in his eyes, as he has loyalty served Lear for ages.” This focus on specific details helps to build the interpretation.
- The commentary of the essay explains how some of the evidence supports the line of reasoning. In paragraph 2, for example, the response suggests that Lear’s dividing up of the kingdom “creates a decline in the kingdoms wellbeing as well as Lear’s because the kingdom is now lead by liars and power-seekers and Lear lost the only understanding, helpful people for him.” The response does not, however, effectively integrate all of the evidence into the line of reasoning. In paragraph 4, for example, the essay’s contention that “Goneril and Reagan lose their sanity for Lear” is not adequately explained. Because

the essay offers specific evidence and explains how some of it supports a line of reasoning, the response earned 3 points in Row B.

**C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- The response does not demonstrate sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument. The last sentence of the final paragraph, “Proving you’re better off letting go when something no longer serves you” does not connect to the line of reasoning and offers a generalization that diminishes the argument.

**Sample Identifier: D**

**Score: 1-2-0**

**A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This essay considers the impact of Victor Frankenstein’s indecision about creating a companion for his creature as seen in *Frankenstein* by Mary Shelley.
- The essay responds to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation of the novel. Paragraph 1 states, “In Mary Shelley’s novel Frankenstein, Victor Frankenstein’s indecision to make a second monster as companion for his first monster leads the monster to commit vicious acts as a means of revenge.” This thesis earned 1 point in Row A.

**B. Evidence Score: 2**

- The evidence provided in the essay is a combination of specific details and broad generalities. A piece of specific evidence is offered in paragraph 2, which explains that when Victor destroys the companion he has begun, “the monster becomes angry and tries to seek revenge, in which he frames Justine for the death of William, her little brother, which causes the people in town to think she is a witch and kills her.” In contrast, paragraph 2 presents the broad observation that “when he [Victor] finally denies the monster’s chance of experiencing love like how he saw humans have, he also crushes his hopes of becoming a normal member of society.”
- No clear line of reasoning is established, because the essay does not clearly explain the connections or progression between the evidence and commentary. In paragraph 2, the essay argues, “Frankenstein’s indecision shatters the monster’s dreams and makes him hateful towards his creator as he feels a sense of mistreatment and inequality.” The essay makes this one point well, but it does not make multiple supporting claims. The essay, therefore, earned 2 points in Row B.

**C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- The response does not demonstrate sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument.



**Sample Identifier: E**

**Score: 1-1-0**

**A. Thesis Score: 1**

- This essay attempts to analyze the impact of Dr. Jekyll’s indecision as seen in Robert Louis Stevenson’s novella, *Strange Case of Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde*.
- The essay offers a defensible interpretation of the impact of Dr. Jekyll’s behavior in the thesis which appears as the first sentence of the essay: “In ‘Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde,’ Dr. Jekyll’s inability to make decisions in the end results in his death.” This thesis earned 1 point in Row A.

**B. Evidence Score: 1**

- The essay offers evidence that is mostly general and tends to focus on summary rather than specific details from the work. For example, in paragraph 2, the response asserts, “Before the beginning of the book Dr. Jekyll has always struggled with his image & his dark side. So, he creates a potion that creates Mr. Hyde (his evil twin if you will.)”
- The commentary summarizes the evidence as well, such as “From this point on, every decision he (Dr. Jekyll) makes brings him closer towards his fate” (paragraph 2). The commentary is broad and does not connect the evidence to an interpretation, and no line of reasoning is established. The essay therefore earned 1 point in Row B.

**C. Sophistication Score: 0**

- The essay did not earn the point in Row C because it does not demonstrate sophistication of thought or develop a complex literary argument. Instead, it oversimplifies tensions within the work, such as when it states, “Dr. Jekyll in & of himself is not a bad person & b/c of that he struggles a lot with his evil urges” (paragraph 3).